

EVE H. WAGNER (State Bar No. 126471)  
ANTHONY D. SBARDELLATI (State Bar No. 246431)  
SAUER & WAGNER LLP  
1801 Century Park East, Suite 1150  
Los Angeles, California 90067  
Tel: (310) 712-8100; Fax: (310) 712-8108  
E-mail: [ewagner@swattys.com](mailto:ewagner@swattys.com); [asbardellati@swattys.com](mailto:asbardellati@swattys.com)

JEREMY FEIGELSON (*of counsel*)  
BRUCE P. KELLER (*of counsel*)  
DEBEVOISE & PLIMPTON LLP  
919 Third Avenue  
New York, New York 10022  
Tel: (212) 909-6000; Fax: (212) 909-6836  
Email: [jfeigelson@debevoise.com](mailto:jfeigelson@debevoise.com); [bpkeller@debevoise.com](mailto:bpkeller@debevoise.com)

Attorneys for Defendant Prometheus Global Media, LLC

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

PENSKE MEDIA CORPORATION,  
dba PMC, a Delaware corporation,

Plaintiff,

v.

PROMETHEUS GLOBAL MEDIA,  
LLC, a Delaware limited liability  
company d/b/a hollywoodreporter.com;  
and DOES 1 through 10, inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No.: CV 11-7560-JST (MRW)  
Hon. Josephine Staton Tucker  
Magistrate: Hon. Michael R.  
Wilner

**DISCOVERY MATTER:  
DECLARATION OF MANISH M.  
SHAH IN OPPOSITION TO PENSKE  
MEDIA CORPORATION'S  
MOTION RE: FURTHER  
RESPONSES TO WRITTEN  
DISCOVERY PROPOUNDED TO  
DEFENDANT PROMETHEUS  
GLOBAL MEDIA, LLC**

**JOINT STIPULATION AND  
[PROPOSED] ORDER (filed  
concurrently)**

Action filed: September 14, 2011  
Trial Date: July 9, 2013

Hearing Date:

1 Manish M. Shah declares:

2 1. I am an employee of defendant Prometheus Global Media, LLC  
3 ("Prometheus"), where I have been employed since June 2010 in the area of computer  
4 services. My job title is Director of Development. Prometheus owns a number of media  
5 properties, including The Hollywood Reporter ("THR"), Billboard and Adweek. My job  
6 duties include working on and managing the development of the websites for these media  
7 properties. Through my job I am generally familiar with how Prometheus runs the  
8 technical side of these websites. I make this declaration on personal knowledge.  
9  
10

11 2. In July and August 2011, Prometheus developed a "carousel" feature for the  
12 THR website, www.hollywoodreporter.com. A carousel is a common website feature  
13 that causes a series of articles or pictures to rotate through a display window on the  
14 homepage. The carousel was a small project, involving the addition to the THR site of a  
15 small amount of code. For small projects such as this, Prometheus typically does not  
16 create any specific budget, and we did not do so in this case. The project was assigned to  
17 Irfan Ali of Nihaki Systems, an outside contractor. Mr. Ali worked with Prometheus  
18 from approximately October 2010 to September 2011. During that time, Mr. Ali worked  
19 on a daily or near-daily basis on a range of projects for various websites.  
20  
21


22 3. From approximately June 2010 through October 2010, Prometheus engaged  
23 in a project to broadly redesign and relaunch the THR website. This was a much larger  
24 project than the later work on the carousel. It involved a different contractor and did not  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 involve Mr. Ali or Nihaki Systems. The budget for the overall revamping of the THR  
2 website was in the seven figures.

3  
4 4. Prometheus employs many personnel who provide services related to its  
5 websites. Prometheus also has regularly hired, and continues to hire, a number of  
6 external vendors to work on various website-related projects.  
7

8  
9 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States and California that  
10 the foregoing is true and correct.

11 Signed November 21, 2012 at New York, New York:  
12

13  
14   
15 Manish M. Shah  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28